IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO **EASTERN DIVISION**

ROBERT ROSS, Individually and On Behalf

No. 2:05-cv-00819-EAS-TPK

of All Others Similarly Situated,

(Consolidated)

Plaintiff,

VS.

JUDGE SARGUS

ABERCROMBIE & FITCH COMPANY, et al.,

MAGISTRATE JUDGE KEMP

Defendants.

SUR-REPLY MEMORANDUM OF DEFENDANT ABERCROMBIE & FITCH CO. IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO COMPEL SPECIAL LITIGATION COMMITTEE REPORT AND RELATED DOCUMENTS

In its Reply Brief, Plaintiff contends that "the substance of what is contained in the Derivative Order is not the same information as Abercrombie publicly released." Reply Brief at 4. That contention is incorrect. In fact, the two specific references to the SLC Report on which plaintiff relies each restate public information:

- Plaintiff cites the Court's statement that "[t]he SLC found that Abercrombie (a) publicly disclosed that its 'clearance' period for spring merchandise 'was planned early' and that the Company did not engage in promotional activities, in accordance with its public strategy." Id.; Derivative Order at 16. In fact, Abercrombie explicitly had disclosed the early clearance sale information in its messages reporting May and June 2005 sales results. See Exhibit A (excerpts from Plaintiff's Deposition Exhibit 108) (May 2005 and June 2005 sales release call scripts). The non-promotional strategy that Abercrombie was pursuing likewise was a matter of public record. See Exhibit B at [81] (transcript of conference call with analysts on February 15, 2005).
- Plaintiff also cites the Court's statement that "[f]or example, the SLC found that (b) Mr. Jeffries had been closed out of several previous trading windows, and traded in accordance

with his established trading pattern and in the keeping with his personal financial planning needs." Reply Brief at 4; Derivative Order at 18. That information too was in the public domain. *See* Exhibit C (Wall Street Journal report) (Aug. 29, 2005).

Because the cited references to the SLC Report set forth public information, and not information protected by the attorney-client privilege or work product doctrine, the Court's references to those statements in the Derivative Order provide no support for the argument that Abercrombie has waived the privilege and work product protections applicable to the SLC Report.

Respectfully submitted,

VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP

By /s/ Philip A. Brown

Philip A. Brown, Trial Attorney (0005712) John J. Kulewicz (0008376) Alycia N. Broz (0070205)

52 East Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Telephone: (614) 464-6357

Facsimile: (614) 719-4641

E-mail: pabrown@vorys.com

E-mail: jjkulewicz@vorys.com

E-mail: anbroz@vorys.com

Counsel for Defendant Abercrombie & Fitch Co.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I served a copy of this memorandum upon the counsel listed on the attached service roster by electronic mail and first-class U.S. mail on September 29, 2009.

/s/ John J. Kulewicz John J. Kulewicz (0008376)

Abercrombie & Fitch Co. Shareholder Litigation (CM-ECF) Service List

Plaintiffs:

Coughlin Stoia Geller Rudman & Robbins LLP

Laura M. Andracchio

Laurie Largent Art Leahy

655 West Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101-4297

Telephone: (619) 231-1058 or (800) 449-4900

(619-231-7423 (fax)
Email: lauraa@csgrr.com
Email: ambere@csgrr.com
Email: artl@csgrr.com

Couglin Stoia Geller Rudman & Robbins LLP

Michael F. Ghozland

9601 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 510

Los Angeles, CA 90210 Telephone: (310) 859-3100

(310) 278-2148 (fax)

Email: mghozland@lerachlaw.com

Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs

Murray Murphy Moul + Basil LLP Geoffrey J. Moul Brian K. Murphy Joseph F. Murray 1533 Lake Shore Drive Columbus, OH 43204 Telephone: (614) 488-0400

(614) 488-0401 (fax)

Email: moul@mmmb.com
Email: murray@mmmb.com

Liaison Counsel

Vanoverbeke Michaud & Timmony, PC Michael E. Moco 79 Alfred Street Detroit, MI 48201 Telephone: (313) 578-1200 (313) 578-1201 (fax)

Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs

Roger P. Sugarman, Trial Attorney Kegler Brown Hill & Ritter 65 E. State Street Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215-4294 Telephone: (614) 462-5400

Fax: (614) 462-5422

Email: rsugarman@keglerbrown.com

Jay B. Kasner Sharon Garb Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP Four Times Square New York, NY 10036 Telephone: (212) 735-3000 Fax: (212) 735-2000

Email: <u>jkasner@skadden.com</u> Email. sgarb@skadden.com

Counsel for Defendant Michael S. Jeffries

Michael R. Szolosi, Sr., Trial Attorney McNamara and McNamara LLP 88 East Broad Street, Suite 1250 Columbus, OH 43215 Telephone: (614) 228-6131

Fax: (614) 228-6126

Email: mrs@mcnamaralaw.us

Stuart M. Gerson Steven E. Skwara Epstein, Becker & Green P.C. 1227 25th Street NW, 7th Floor Washington, DC 20037 Telephone: (202) 861-0900

Fax: (202) 896-2882

Email: sgerson@ebglaw.com
Email: sskwara@ebglaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Robert S. Singer